

TEACHING MATERIAL GUIDANCE

1. Title of the material

Transport for London - Evaluation of Freight Consolidation Demonstrator Projects.

<https://content.tfl.gov.uk/steer-assessment-of-demos-report-oct-2019.pdf>

2. Which section of the SUMP it is relevant to?

It is relevant to section 12.1 as it cover evaluation of several consolidation initiatives across London.

3. Which Mobility Manager knowledge this material is the most relevant to?

It is relevant to section 4 of Mobility Manager knowledge, referring to logistics and urban freight management. It may be also associated with point 1e), covering evaluation of transport measures.

4. Problem approached and content overview

The report was ordered by Transport for London (TfL) to identify opportunities and potential benefits of freight consolidation. It has following objectives:

1. Identification of transport impacts of freight consolidation and possibility to quantify them.
2. Identification of “proof on concept” for various approaches to freight consolidation, supporting their wider implementation and good practices transfer.

A research framework has been developed to evaluate ten examples of consolidation and compare their benefits and challenges. Various demonstrators were considered, including:

- pedestrian portorage as a last mile solution,
- collaborative procurement,
- reduction of personal deliveries,
- impacts of servicing contracts consolidation,
- waste consolidation,
- deliver consolidation centres (urban and micro-consolidation),
- capacity sharing based on technological solutions.

The evaluation is based on data sources collected by demonstrator project leaders. There was no additional data collection or monitoring. A consistent framework was used to review and compare the demonstrator schemes. It was based on a set of criteria reflecting their impact, governance and potential for wider roll-out. It included both scorable and non-scorable elements presented below:

Scorable elements	Non-scorable elements
environmental impact	challenges encountered
traffic impact	lessons learned
time required for implementation	risk strategy
cost of implementation	governance structure



TEACHING MATERIAL GUIDANCE

customer satisfaction	importance of people relationships
achievement of objectives	
effective communication	
ability to roll out	
cost of wider roll out	

For the elements that can be assessed quantitatively, each demonstrator has been awarded a score based on two aspects securing balanced evaluation:

1. Level of change or impact, on a scale of 1 (low impact) to 5 (high impact)
2. Robustness of the evidence, on a scale of a to c (a-more robust, c-less robust).

Result of application of this methodology is presented below:

Table 3.2: Summary of scorable areas

	Environmental Impact	Traffic / congestion impact	Time required for implementation	Cost of implementation	Customer satisfaction	Achievement of Objectives	Effective communication	Ability to roll out	Cost of wider roll out
ED1 Pedestrian Portage	4b	4a	4b	3b	3c	4b	4b	4a	4b
ED2 Education Sector	-	-	1b	1c	-	1b	1b	-	-
ED3 Delivering Better Air – Freight Consolidation at Somerset House	4b	5a	2b	4b	4b	4b	5a	4a	3a
ED4 'One Tfl' Logistics Demonstrator	2c	2b	4b	3c	4a	3a	3b	3c	3b
ED5 West End Commercial Vehicle Reduction	5a	5a	4a	3a	3b	4a	4a	3b	3b
ED6 Capacity Sharing	2c	2c	4b	5b	2b	2b	3b	2b	3b
ED7 Camden Freight Consolidation Centre	4c	5c	2a	2b	3b	4b	4b	2b	2b
ED8 Barnet Decision to Join Camden Consolidation Centre	-	-	2a	1c	-	-	3b	2b	3b
ED9a Central London Micro Consolidation	-	-	2a	3b	-	2c	3b	-	-
ED9b Grosvenor Micro Consolidation	5a	5a	3a	2a	5a	4b	4a	3b	3c
ED10 Copeland Park Waste Consolidation	5b	5b	3a	4b	4a	5b	5a	4a	3b

5. Who could be interested in this material?

The report aims at understanding the success factors of different consolidation initiatives implemented in practice, hence it is a valuable source of information for decisionmakers at local level. Their intention might be to understand methods of supporting bottom-up individual consolidation initiatives. There is also an inspiration for authority-led actions as well. Students might be interested in cross-cutting evaluation of selected demonstrators which could help to gain more knowledge on practical determinants of urban freight measures.



TEACHING MATERIAL GUIDANCE

6. What is worth mentioning as an innovative factor for the reader?

- report is based on practical and proven examples of consolidation initiatives, which goes beyond only trial period of many similar previous concepts,
- comprehensive and well balanced list of criteria rendering the most important aspects of freight consolidation,
- easy to understand scoring system,
- clear interpretation of results and problem-oriented recommendations.

7. Limitations

No major limitations were identified.

